# Introduction to Algorithms and Data Structures 

Dynamic Programming - Subset Sum and Knapsack

The subset sum problem

## The subset sum problem

We are given a set of $n$ items $\{1,2, \ldots, n\}$.

## The subset sum problem

We are given a set of $n$ items $\{1,2, \ldots, n\}$.

Each item $i$ has a non-negative weight $w_{i}$.

## The subset sum problem

We are given a set of $n$ items $\{1,2, \ldots, n\}$.

Each item $i$ has a non-negative weight $w_{i}$.

We are given a bound W.

## The subset sum problem

We are given a set of n items $\{1,2, \ldots, n\}$.

Each item $i$ has a non-negative weight $w_{i}$.
We are given a bound $W$.

Goal: Select a subset $S$ of the items such that
$\sum_{i \in N} w_{i} \leq W$ and $\sum_{i \in N} w_{i}$ is maximised.

## To be more precise

We are given a set of $n$ items $\{1,2, \ldots, n\}$.

Each item $i$ has a non-negative weight $w_{i}$.
We are given a bound W.

## To be more precise

We are given a set of n items $\{1,2, \ldots, n\}$.

Each item $i$ has a non-negative weight $w_{i}$.

We are given a bound W.

How are these inputs represented by a computer?

## Representation

## Representation

Let's say that $w_{3}=5$.

## Representation

Let's say that $w_{3}=5$.
How do we "save" 5 in a computer, using only 0 and 1 ?

## Representation

Let's say that $w_{3}=5$.
How do we "save" 5 in a computer, using only 0 and 1 ?

Binary representation: $5_{10}=101_{2} \rightarrow 101$

## Representation

Let's say that $w_{3}=5$.
How do we "save" 5 in a computer, using only 0 and 1 ?

Binary representation: $5_{10}=101_{2} \rightarrow 101$

Unary representation: $5_{10} \rightarrow 11111$

## The subset sum problem

We are given a set of n items $\{1,2, \ldots, n\}$.

Each item $i$ has a non-negative weight $w_{i}$ given in binary representation.

We are given a bound W given in binary representation.

Goal: Select a subset $S$ of the items such that
$\sum_{i \in N} w_{i} \leq W$ and $\sum_{i \in N} w_{i}$ is maximised.

## Our input



## The subset sum problem

We are given a set of n items $\{1,2, \ldots, n\}$.

Each item $i$ has a non-negative weight $w_{i}$.
We are given a bound $W$.

Goal: Select a subset $S$ of the items such that
$\sum_{i \in N} w_{i} \leq W$ and $\sum_{i \in N} w_{i}$ is maximised.

## Greedy Approaches

## Greedy Approaches

- Ideas?


## Greedy Approaches

- Ideas?
- Sort items in terms of decreasing weight and put them in S one by one.


## Greedy Approaches

- Ideas?
- Sort items in terms of decreasing weight and put them in S one by one.
- Sort items in terms of increasing weight and put them in S one by one.


## Greedy Approaches

- Sort items in terms of decreasing weight and put them in S one by one.


## Greedy Approaches

- Sort items in terms of decreasing weight and put them in S one by one.
- Example where this fails?


## Greedy Approaches

- Sort items in terms of decreasing weight and put them in S one by one.
- Example where this fails?
- $W=4, W_{1}=3, W_{2}=2, W_{3}=2$.


## Greedy Approaches

- Sort items in terms of increasing weight and put them in $S$ one by one.


## Greedy Approaches

- Sort items in terms of increasing weight and put them in $S$ one by one.
- Example where this fails?


## Greedy Approaches

- Sort items in terms of increasing weight and put them in S one by one.
- Example where this fails?
- $W=4, W_{1}=1, W_{2}=2, w_{3}=2$.


## Dynamic Programming

## Dynamic Programming

- We need to identify the appropriate subproblems to use in order to solve the main problem.


## Dynamic Programming

- We need to identify the appropriate subproblems to use in order to solve the main problem.
- Recall the weighted interval scheduling problem. Similar approach.


## Dynamic Programming

- We need to identify the appropriate subproblems to use in order to solve the main problem.
- Recall the weighted interval scheduling problem. Similar approach.
- Let $\mathrm{O}_{i}$ be the optimal solution to the subset be the optimal solution to the subset sum problem, using a subset of $\{1,2, \ldots, i\}$, and let OPT(i) be its value.


## Dynamic Programming

- We need to identify the appropriate subproblems to use in order to solve the main problem.
- Recall the weighted interval scheduling problem. Similar approach.
- Let $\mathrm{O}_{i}$ be the optimal solution to the subset be the optimal solution to the subset sum problem, using a subset of $\{1,2, \ldots, i\}$, and let OPT(i) be its value.
- Hence O is $\mathrm{O}_{\mathrm{n}}$, and OPT $=\operatorname{OPT}(n)$


## Dynamic Programming

- We need to identify the appropriate subproblems to use in order to solve the main problem.
- Recall the weighted interval scheduling problem. Similar approach.
- Let $\mathrm{O}_{i}$ be the optimal solution to the subset be the optimal solution to the subset sum problem, using a subset of $\{1,2, \ldots, i\}$, and let OPT(i) be its value.
- Hence O is $\mathrm{O}_{n}$, and OPT $=\operatorname{OPT}(n)$
- Should item $n$ be in the optimal solution O or not?


## Dynamic Programming

- We need to identify the appropriate subproblems to use in order to solve the main problem.
- Recall the weighted interval scheduling problem. Similar approach.
- Let $\mathrm{O}_{i}$ be the optimal solution to the subset be the optimal solution to the subset sum problem, using a subset of $\{1,2, \ldots, i\}$, and let OPT(i) be its value.
- Hence $O$ is $O_{n}$, and OPT $=\operatorname{OPT}(n)$
- Should item $n$ be in the optimal solution O or not?
- If no, then $\operatorname{OPT}(n-1)=\operatorname{OPT}(n)$


## Dynamic Programming

- We need to identify the appropriate subproblems to use in order to solve the main problem.
- Recall the weighted interval scheduling problem. Similar approach.
- Let $\mathrm{O}_{i}$ be the optimal solution to the subset be the optimal solution to the subset sum problem, using a subset of $\{1,2, \ldots, i\}$, and let OPT(i) be its value.
- Hence $O$ is $O_{n}$, and OPT $=\operatorname{OPT}(n)$
- Should item $n$ be in the optimal solution O or not?
- If no, then $\operatorname{OPT}(n-1)=\operatorname{OPT}(n)$
- If yes, ?


## If $n$ is in O

## If $n$ is in $O$

- What information do we get about the other items?


## If $n$ is in $O$

- What information do we get about the other items?
- In weighted interval scheduling, we could remove all intervals overlapping with $n$.


## If $n$ is in $O$

- What information do we get about the other items?
- In weighted interval scheduling, we could remove all intervals overlapping with $n$.
- Can we do something similar here?


## If $n$ is in 0

- What information do we get about the other items?
- In weighted interval scheduling, we could remove all intervals overlapping with $n$.
- Can we do something similar here?
- There is no reason to a-priori exclude any remaining item, unless adding it would exceed the weight.


## If $n$ is in $O$

- What information do we get about the other items?
- In weighted interval scheduling, we could remove all intervals overlapping with $n$.
- Can we do something similar here?
- There is no reason to a-priori exclude any remaining item, unless adding it would exceed the weight.
- The only information that we really get is that we now have weight $W-W_{n}$ left.


## What we really need

## What we really need

- To find the optimal value OPT(n), we need


## What we really need

- To find the optimal value OPT(n), we need
- The optimal value $\operatorname{OPT}(n-1)$ if $n$ is not in $O$.


## What we really need

- To find the optimal value OPT(n), we need
- The optimal value OPT(n-1) if $n$ is not in $O$.
- The optimal value of the solution on input $\{1,2, \ldots, n-1\}$ and $w=W-w_{n}$.


## What we really need

- To find the optimal value OPT(n), we need
- The optimal value OPT(n-1) if $n$ is not in $O$.
- The optimal value of the solution on input $\{1,2, \ldots, n-1\}$ and $w=W-w_{n}$.
- How many subproblems do we need?


## What we really need

- To find the optimal value OPT(n), we need
- The optimal value OPT(n-1) if $n$ is not in $O$.
- The optimal value of the solution on input $\{1,2, \ldots, n-1\}$ and $w=W-w_{n}$.
- How many subproblems do we need?
- One for each initial set $\{1,2, \ldots, i\}$ of items and each possible value for the remaining weight w .


## Subproblems

## Subproblems

- Assumptions:


## Subproblems

- Assumptions:
- $W$ is an integer.


## Subproblems

- Assumptions:
- $W$ is an integer.
- Every $w_{i}$ is an integer.


## Subproblems

- Assumptions:
- $W$ is an integer.
- Every $w_{i}$ is an integer.
- We will have one subproblem for each $i=0,1, \ldots, n$ and each integer $0 \leq \mathrm{w} \leq \mathrm{W}$.


## Subproblems

- Assumptions:
- $W$ is an integer.
- Every $w_{i}$ is an integer.
- We will have one subproblem for each $i=0,1, \ldots, n$ and each integer $0 \leq \mathrm{w} \leq \mathrm{W}$.
- Let OPT(i,w) be the value of the optimal solution on subset $\{1,2, \ldots, i\}$ and maximum allowed weight $w$.


## Subproblems

## Subproblems

- Using this notation, what are we looking for?


## Subproblems

- Using this notation, what are we looking for?
- OPT(n,W)


## Subproblems

- Using this notation, what are we looking for?
- OPT(n,W)
- Should item $n$ be in the optimal solution O or not?


## Subproblems

- Using this notation, what are we looking for?
- OPT(n,W)
- Should item $n$ be in the optimal solution O or not?
- If no, then $\operatorname{OPT}(n, W)=\operatorname{OPT}(n-1, W)$.


## Subproblems

- Using this notation, what are we looking for?
- OPT(n,W)
- Should item $n$ be in the optimal solution $O$ or not?
- If no, then $\operatorname{OPT}(n, W)=\operatorname{OPT}(n-1, W)$.
- If yes, then $\operatorname{OPT}(n, W)=w_{n}+\operatorname{OPT}\left(n-1, W-w_{n}\right)$.


## Subproblems



## Subproblems



## Subproblems



## Algorithm

Algorithm SubsetSum(n,W)
Array $\mathrm{M}=[0 \ldots n, 0 \ldots \mathrm{~W}]$
Initialise $\mathrm{M}[0, \mathrm{w}]=0$, for each $\mathrm{w}=0,1, \ldots, \mathrm{~W}$
For $\mathrm{i}=1,2, \ldots, n$
For $w=0, \ldots, W$
If $\left(w_{i}>w^{2}\right) \quad{ }^{*}$ If the item does not fit ${ }^{*}$ $M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]$
Else
$M[i, w]=\max \left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}$
Endlf
Return M[n, W]

## Two dimensional array

| $n$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $n-1$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ... | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ... | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $i$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| i-1 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\cdots$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | $\ldots$ | W-Wi |  |  | W |  |  |  | W |

## Two dimensional array

| $n$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | OPT( $n, W$ ) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $n-1$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ... | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| .. | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $i$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| i-1 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\ldots$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | . | W-Wi |  |  | W |  |  |  | W |

## Two dimensional array

| $n$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | OPT(n,W) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| n-1 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\nabla$ |
| ... | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ... | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $i$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| i-1 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ... | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | $\ldots$ | w-wi |  |  | w |  |  |  | W |

## Two dimensional array



## Two dimensional array

| $n$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | OPT(n,W) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| n-1 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\mathrm{OPT}(n-1, W)$ |  |
| ... | 0 |  |  |  |  |  | $\mathrm{OPT}\left(n-2, \mathrm{~W}-\mathrm{w}_{n-2}\right)$ |  |  |  |  |
| ... | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | OPT(n-2,W) |
| $i$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $i-1$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ... | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | ... | w-wi |  |  | w |  |  |  | W |

## Two dimensional array

| $n$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | OPT(n,W) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| n-1 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\mathrm{OPT}(n-1, \mathrm{~W})$ |  |
| ... | 0 |  |  |  |  |  | $\mathrm{OPT}\left(n-2, \mathrm{~W}-\mathrm{w}_{n-2}\right)$ |  |  |  |  |
| ... | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | OPT(n-2,W) |
| $i$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $i-1$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ... | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | ... | w-wi |  |  | w |  |  |  | W |

## Two dimensional array

| $n$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | OPT(n,W) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| n-1 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | OPT $(n-1, W)$ |  |
| $\ldots$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  | $\mathrm{OPT}\left(n-2, \mathrm{~W}-\mathrm{w}_{n-2}\right)$ |  |  |  |  |
| ... | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | OPT( $n-2, \mathrm{~W}$ ) |
| $i$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $i-1$ | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ... | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | ... | w-wi |  |  | w |  |  |  | W |

## Two dimensional array



## Two dimensional array



## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

Array $\mathrm{M}=[0 \ldots \mathrm{n}, 0 \ldots \mathrm{~W}]$
Initialise $M[0, w]=0$, for each $w=0,1, \ldots, W$

## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
        \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

For $w=0, \ldots, W$
If $\left(w_{i}>w\right)$ doesn't fit
$M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]$
Else
$M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{\mathrm{M}[i-1, w], w_{i}+\mathrm{M}\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}$
Endlf

## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
        \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

For $w=0, \ldots, W$
If $\left(w_{i}>w\right)$ doesn't fit
$M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]$
Else
$M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{\mathrm{M}[i-1, w], w_{i}+\mathrm{M}\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}$
Endlf

## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
\(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
Else
\(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

For $w=0, \ldots, W$
If $\left(w_{i}>w\right)$ fits
$M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]$
Else
$\mathrm{M}[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{\mathrm{M}[i-1, w], w_{i}+\mathrm{M}\left[i-1, w-\mathrm{w}_{\mathrm{i}}\right]\right\}$
Endlf

## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.



## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.



## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 |  |  |  |  |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
\(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
Else
\(\mathrm{M}[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{\mathrm{M}[i-1, w], w_{i}+\mathrm{M}\left[i-1, w-\mathrm{w}_{\mathrm{i}}\right]\right\}\)
Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
        \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
        \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| - | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
\(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
Else
\(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 0 | 0 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| - | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
        \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| - | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
        \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| - | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
        \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 4 |  |  |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
    \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| - | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For w = \(0, \ldots\), W
If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
\(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
Else
\(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| - | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For w = \(0, \ldots\), W
If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
\(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
Else
\(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
        \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 | 0 | 0 | 2 |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
        \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 3 |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
        \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 3 | 4 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
        \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| - | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
        \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For \(w=0, \ldots, W\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
        \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
```


## Example

- $n=3, W=6, w_{1}=w_{2}=2$ and $w_{3}=3$.

| 3 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |

```
For w = \(0, \ldots\), W
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w\right)\)
        \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { m a x }}\left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
```


## From values to solutions

- Very similar idea to weighted interval scheduling



## Running Time

## Running Time

- Similar to weighted interval scheduling.


## Running Time

- Similar to weighted interval scheduling.
- We are building up a table $M$ of solutions (instead of an array).


## Running Time

- Similar to weighted interval scheduling.
- We are building up a table $M$ of solutions (instead of an array).
- We compute each value $M(i, w)$ of the table in $O(1)$ time using the previous values.


## Running Time

- Similar to weighted interval scheduling.
- We are building up a table $M$ of solutions (instead of an array).
- We compute each value $M(i, w)$ of the table in $O(1)$ time using the previous values.
- What is the running time overall?


## Running Time

- Similar to weighted interval scheduling.
- We are building up a table M of solutions (instead of an array).
- We compute each value $M(i, w)$ of the table in $O(1)$ time using the previous values.
- What is the running time overall?
- How many entries does the table M have?


## Running Time

## Running Time

- SubsetSum $(n, W)$ runs in time $O(n W)$.


## Running Time

- SubsetSum $(n, W)$ runs in time $O(n W)$.
- Is this a polynomial time algorithm?


## Running Time

- SubsetSum $(n, \mathrm{~W})$ runs in time $\mathrm{O}(n \mathrm{~W})$.
- Is this a polynomial time algorithm?
- Not quite, because it depends on W.


## Our input



## Running Time

- SubsetSum $(n, W)$ runs in time $O(n W)$.
- Is this a polynomial time algorithm?


## Running Time

- SubsetSum $(n, \mathrm{~W})$ runs in time $\mathrm{O}(n \mathrm{~W})$.
- Is this a polynomial time algorithm?
- It is pseudopolynomial, as it runs in time polynomial in $n$ and the unary representation of W .


## Running Time

- SubsetSum $(n, \mathrm{~W})$ runs in time $\mathrm{O}(n \mathrm{~W})$.
- Is this a polynomial time algorithm?
- It is pseudopolynomial, as it runs in time polynomial in $n$ and the unary representation of W.
- It is fairly efficient, if in the number involved in the input are reasonably small.


## Should we be happy?

## Should we be happy?

- Pseudopolynomial is good in some cases.


## Should we be happy?

- Pseudopolynomial is good in some cases.
- But why not polynomial?


## Should we be happy?

- Pseudopolynomial is good in some cases.
- But why not polynomial?
- How hard is it to design a polynomial time algorithm for subset sum?


## Should we be happy?

- Pseudopolynomial is good in some cases.
- But why not polynomial?
- How hard is it to design a polynomial time algorithm for subset sum?
- Hard enough to justify a reward of 1 million dollars!

SI

## If you can solve this math problem you'll get a \$1 million prize - and change internet security as we know it

- Pseudopolynomial is good in some cases.
- But why not polynomial?
- How hard is it to design a polynomial time algorithm for subset sum?
- Hard enough to justify a reward of 1 million dollars!

SI

## If you can solve this math problem you'll get a \$1 million prize - and change internet security as we know it

- Pseudopolynomial is good in some cases.
- But why not polynomial?
- How hard is it to design a polynomial time algorithm for subset sum?
- Hard enough to justify a reward of 1 million dollars!
- Subset sum is NP-hard!

SI

## If you can solve this math problem you'll get a \$1 million prize - and change internet security as we know it

- Pseudopolynomial is good in some cases.
- But why not polynomial?
- How hard is it to design a polynomial time algorithm for subset sum?
- Hard enough to justify a reward of 1 million dollars!
- Subset sum is NP-hard!
- More about that later on in the course.

The subset sum problem

## The subset sum problem

We are given a set of $n$ items $\{1,2, \ldots, n\}$.

## The subset sum problem

We are given a set of $n$ items $\{1,2, \ldots, n\}$.

Each item $i$ has a non-negative weight $w_{i}$.

## The subset sum problem

We are given a set of $n$ items $\{1,2, \ldots, n\}$.

Each item $i$ has a non-negative weight $w_{i}$.

We are given a bound W.

## The subset sum problem

We are given a set of n items $\{1,2, \ldots, n\}$.

Each item $i$ has a non-negative weight $w_{i}$.
We are given a bound $W$.

Goal: Select a subset $S$ of the items such that
$\sum_{i \in N} w_{i} \leq W$ and $\sum_{i \in N} w_{i}$ is maximised.

## The (0/1) knapsack problem

We are given a set of $n$ items $\{1,2, \ldots, n\}$.

Each item $i$ has a non-negative weight $w_{i}$ and a non-negative value $\mathrm{v}_{\mathrm{i}}$.

We are given a bound $W$.

Goal: Select a subset S of the items such that
$\sum_{i \in N} w_{i} \leq W$ and $\sum_{i \in N} v_{i}$ is maximised.

## The knapsack problem

- The subset sum problem is a specific instance of the knapsack problem (why?)


## 3 minute exercise

Design a dynamic programming algorithm for 0/1 knapsack.

Algorithm SubsetSum( $n$, W)

```
Array \(\mathrm{M}=[0 \ldots n, 0 \ldots \mathrm{~W}]\)
Initialise \(\mathrm{M}[0, w]=0\), for each \(w=0,1, \ldots, \mathrm{w}\)
For \(\mathrm{i}=1,2, \ldots, n\)
    For \(w=0, \ldots, w\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w^{2}\right)\)
        \(M[i, w]=M[i-1, w]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\max \left\{M[i-1, w], w_{i}+M\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
Return M[n, W]
```


## 3 minute exercise

Design a dynamic programming algorithm for 0/1 knapsack.

Algorithm SubsetSum( $n$, W)

```
Array \(\mathrm{M}=[0 \ldots n, 0 \ldots \mathrm{~W}]\)
Initialise \(\mathrm{M}[0, w]=0\), for each \(w=0,1, \ldots, \mathrm{w}\)
For \(\mathrm{i}=1,2, \ldots, n\)
    For \(w=0, \ldots, w\)
    If \(\left(w_{i}>w^{2}\right)\)
        \(\mathrm{M}[i, \mathrm{w}]=\mathrm{M}[i-1, \mathrm{w}]\)
    Else
        \(M[i, w]=\max \left\{M[i-1, w], W\left[i-1, w-w_{i}\right]\right\}\)
    Endlf
Return M[n, W]
```


## Reading

- Kleinberg and Tardos 6.4.
- Roughgarden 16.5.

