## Permission Impossible by Sibylle Sehl

Early lab test done as part of an MSc project

## Is this screen usable?



## Lab test of Security Game

1. Informed Consent
2. Pre-questionnaire
3. Play the game
4. Post-questionnaire
5. Post discussion with participants (mini focus group)


# Designing computer-based rewards with and for children with Autism Spectrum Disorder and/or Intellectual Disability 

by Aurora Constantin, Hilary Johnson, Elizabeth Smith, Denise Lengyel, Mark Brosnan, Computer in Human Behavior 2017

Research project website:

Full length article

# Designing computer-based rewards with and for children with Autism Spectrum Disorder and/or Intellectual Disability 

Dr Aurora Constantin ${ }^{\text {a }}$, Dr Hilary Johnson ${ }^{\text {b }}$, Dr Elizabeth Smith ${ }^{\text {b }}$, Denise Lengyel ${ }^{\text {a }}$, Mark Brosnan Prof. ${ }^{\text {b, * }}$

${ }^{\text {a }}$ University of Bath, Department of Computer Science, UK
${ }^{\text {b }}$ University of Bath, Department of Psychology, UK

## ARTICLE INFO

## Article history:

Received 20 December 2016
Received in revised form
27 April 2017
Accepted 22 May 2017
Available online 22 May 2017

## Keywords:

Autism Spectrum Disorders
Intellectual disability
Rewards
Participatory design
Computer-assisted learning
Technology design

## A B S TRACT

Children with Autism Spectrum Disorder (ASD) tend to have an affinity for digital technologies, often preferring computer-assisted learning to human-assisted learning. Many children with ASD are also diagnosed with Intellectual Disabilities (ID), yet design studies involving children with ASD and ID are scarce. Rewards can have a positive impact on children's learning and motivation, but little is known about the nature and impact of rewards for children with ASD, and/or ID. Digital technologies are well placed to provide task-based rewards, and in combination with a better understanding of the reward preferences of children with ASD and/or ID this has significant potential to enhance learning. This paper presents two robust participatory design (PD) studies involving children with: i) ASD; ii) ID; and iii) both ASD and ID. The studies aimed to identify: i) the reward preferences of children with ASD and/or ID (RQ1) and ii) how rewards might develop throughout a task as the child progresses (RQ2). Results revealed a number of reward categories that were common to all children, as well as children's preferences for how rewards could develop as they progress through computer-based tasks, for the first time. Original implications for designing computer-based rewards embedded within digital intervention/educational technologies for children with ASD and/or ID, are discussed.
© 2017 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

- RQ1: What are the preferred rewards of children with ASD, ID, or ASD and ID?
- RQ2: As a characteristic of children with ASD is a preference for sameness and repetition, how might digital rewards adapt or develop (if at all) as children progress through a task?

ASD=Autism Spectrum Disorders; ID= Intellectual Disabilities

## Multi-methods approach

| Study | Aims | Methods | Participants |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Study 1 ( $3 \times 60$ minutes sessions) | To identify what kinds of reward children liked. <br> 2. To collect, discuss and prioritize ideas for rewards. <br> 3. To explore the design space and refine the reward requirements. | Testing existing apps Brainstorming Prototyping | 3 children with ASD |
| Study 2 (1 x 60 minutes session) | 1. To discover what types of reward children with ASD and/or ID prefer. 2. To explore how rewards could be developed and presented in a technology-based intervention. | Questionnaire <br> Card sorting Prototyping | 12 children (4 with ASD \& ID, 4 with ASD, and 4 with ID) |

## Participants

- 15 children with ASD \& ID, ASD, and ID
- aged 11-13 (Mean: 12)
- 10 were male
- fluent in English
- communication skills at the level expected of a typically developing child aged 6-9 years.
- recruited through a special school for children with ASD and/or ID, located in south of
England


## Protocol - Study 1

1. Informed consent from parents
2. Informed assent from children
3. Session 1 - Testing existing apps (Story Maker \& ISISS)
4. Session 2 - Brainstorming
5. Session 3-Prototyping
6. Researchers analysed data
7. Interviewer shows participant report and discusses

## Study 1 - materials



Support materials for Idea generation: [left] worksheet;
[right] images to support children in generating ideas on "rewards" topic.

## Study 1 - outcomes



Children prototypes: [left] Example of a prototype manually coded
[right] rewards that develop

## Protocol - Study 2

1. Informed consent from parents
2. Informed assent from children
3. Activity 1 - identify the children's favourite reward topics (started from 9 topics outlined by South et al. 2005)
4. Activity 2 - select an instance from the favourite topic categories
5. Activity 3 - build a reward that develops
6. Researchers analysed data

South, M., Ozonoff, S., \& McMahon, W. M. (2005). Repetitive behavior profiles in AS and high-functioning autism. J of Autism and Dev Disorders, 35(2), 145-158

## Study 2 - materials



Excerpts from a worksheet containing a list of the 9 categories of rewards
Activity 1: "Selecting the favourite topic categories of rewards"

## Study 2 - materials



Examples of reward instances
Activity 2: "Selecting an instance from the favourite topic categories"

## Study 2 - materials


[left] worksheet for a reward that develops; [right] visual representations of the features to be used for developing the reward levels - taken from study 1 Activity 3: "Building a reward that develops"

## Study 2 - outcomes

Activity 1 - Selecting the favorite topic category of rewards ( $\mathrm{PR} / \mathrm{NJ}=$ Power Rangers/Ninja Turtles, ND=Natural Disasters, JA=Japanese Animations, GC=Games on Computer, $\mathrm{D}=$ Dinosaurs, $\mathrm{E} / \mathrm{FB}$-Encyclopedias/Fact Books, $\mathrm{S} / \mathrm{P}=$ Space/Physics, G/ $\mathrm{D}=$ Gadgets/Devices, $\mathrm{HF}=$ Historical Events, $\checkmark=$ stands for a favorite category).

| Part. | PR/NT | ND | JA | GC | D | E/FB | S/P | G/D | HE | Others |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| G2_1 | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  | Dragons |
| G2_2 |  | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | Horse riding |
| G2_3 |  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  | Pets |
| G2_4 | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  |  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | Pirates |
| Total G2 | $\mathbf{2}$ | $\mathbf{3}$ | $\mathbf{1}$ | $\mathbf{3}$ | $\mathbf{2}$ | $\mathbf{1}$ | $\mathbf{2}$ | 4 | $\mathbf{2}$ | N/A |
| G3_1 | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  | Drama performing |
| G3_2 | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | Starwars |
| G3_3 | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  | Cats \& dogs |
| G34 |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | Spiders |
| Total G3 | $\mathbf{3}$ | $\mathbf{2}$ | $\mathbf{2}$ | $\mathbf{3}$ | $\mathbf{3}$ | $\mathbf{1}$ | $\mathbf{3}$ | $\mathbf{4}$ | $\mathbf{2}$ | N/A |
| Total | $\mathbf{5}$ | $\mathbf{5}$ | $\mathbf{3}$ | $\mathbf{6}$ | $\mathbf{5}$ | $\mathbf{2}$ | $\mathbf{5}$ | $\mathbf{8}$ | $\mathbf{4}$ | N/A |

## Study 2 - outcomes

Activity 2 - Card Sorting (favorite topic instances) ( $\mathrm{a}=$ fist image instance, $\mathrm{b}=$ second image instance, $\mathrm{o}=$ other instance selected by the child from Internet, $\checkmark=$ instances that are 'liked').

| Part. | PR/NT | ND | JA | GC | D | E/FB | S/P | G/D | HE | Others | Most liked |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| G1_1 |  | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark \mathrm{a}$ ¢ ${ }^{\text {b }}$ | $\checkmark \mathrm{a}$ b | $\checkmark \mathrm{a}$, b |  | $\checkmark \mathrm{a}$, b | $\checkmark$ a | N/A |  | Dinosaurs |
| G1_2 | $\checkmark \mathrm{b}$ | $\checkmark$ b | $\checkmark$ b | $\checkmark$ a |  |  | $\checkmark$ a |  | N/A |  | Not sure |
| G1_3 |  |  |  | $\checkmark \mathrm{a} \& \mathrm{~b}$ | $\checkmark \mathrm{a}$, b |  | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a | N/A | Drawnimal (iPad game) | Angry Birds |
| G1_4 | $\checkmark$ a |  | $\sqrt{ }$ a |  |  | $\checkmark$ a |  | $\checkmark$ a | N/A |  | Not sure |
| Total G1 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 3 | 3 | N/A | N/A | N/A |
| G2_1 | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a |  |  | $\checkmark$ a |  | Dragons | Dinosaurs |
| G2_2 |  | $\checkmark$ a |  | $\checkmark$ a |  | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a | Horse riding | Books |
| G2_3 |  |  |  | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a |  |  | $\checkmark$ a |  | Pets | Pets |
| G2_4 | $\checkmark$ a | Jo |  | $\checkmark$ a |  |  | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a | Pirates | Ninja turtles |
| Total G2 | 2 | 3 | 1 | 4 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 4 | 2 | N/A | N/A |
| G3_1 | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a |  | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a |  | Drama performing | iPad |
| G3_2 | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark \mathrm{a}$ | Starwars | Starwars |
| G3_3 | $\checkmark$ a |  | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a | Jo | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ a |  | Cats \& dogs | iPad |
| G3_4 |  | $\checkmark$ a |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ a | $\checkmark$ a | Spiders | Spider |
| Total G3 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 1 | 3 | 4 | 2 | N/A | N/A |
| Total | 7 | 7 | 6 | 10 | 7 | 3 | 8 | 11 | 4 | N/A | N/A |

## Study 2 - outcomes



Feature preferences in the Activity 3: "Building a reward that develops" activity.

## Summary - contributions

- Theoretically - raises a series of theoretical questions to be addressed about:
- the role of sameness and difference in reward stimuli to be interacted with by children with ASD and/or ID
- the role of rewards in behavioural interventions
- Methodologically - by adopting a robust, informed and flexible approach, it is possible to include children with ASD, and/or ID in a PD process.
- Empirically - provided data, currently very scarce, about three different groups of children offering novel solutions to design rewards to be embedded within digital technologies
- Practically - design suggestions and implications, supported by an albeit limited evidence base, for utilizing specific categories of reward to be included within digital technologies.

